



**Social Learning Space Evaluations: Practical Examples within the Literature**

Authors: Candace Roberts, Lilly Jean-Pierre, Dr. Francine Darroch

For more information, contact Dr. Francine Darroch at the Department of Health Sciences at Carleton University

**To cite this document:** Roberts, C., Jean-Pierre, L., Darroch, F. (2022). Social Learning Space Evaluations: A Review of the Literature [Unpublished document]. Carleton University.

Reference	Type of study	Type of Social Learning Space	Intervention	Evaluation
<p>Zhang, W., &amp; Watts, S. (2008). Online communities as communities of practice: a case study. <i>Journal of Knowledge Management</i>.</p>	<p>Case study</p>	<p>Communities of practice</p>	<p>Evaluated an online community forum</p>	<p>Authors analyzed forum messages using this practice-identity framework. For example, through the messages, they attempted to identify components of a CoP, such as mutual engagement (how the community interacts), a shared repertoire (what's produced from the space or the routines and language), and a joint enterprise (interest of the community). Its primary data source was the messages that were exchanged on the forum as well as interviewing the moderator of the forum.</p> <p>N=7853 messages downloaded in 2,123 threads</p>
<p>Laursen, B. (2015). Communities of Practice Impact Evaluation Report. <a href="https://www.talent.wisc.edu/home/Portals/0/fp2e/LTD%20CoP%20Impact%20Eval%20Report%20FINAL.pdf">https://www.talent.wisc.edu/home/Portals/0/fp2e/LTD%20CoP%20Impact%20Eval%20Report%20FINAL.pdf</a></p>		<p>Communities of practice</p>	<p>To develop the leadership capabilities and facilitation skills of social learning leaders engaged in action learning</p>	<p>To guide the evaluation, they used Kirkpatrick's Level of Impact and Wenger's Elements of a CoP. The main data sources that were used included meeting notes, guided reflections, and surveys.</p> <p>Two types of surveys: Survey 1: N=58 Survey 2: N=26</p>

<p>Kraft, E., &amp; Culver, D. M. (2021). Using an action learning approach to support women social learning leaders' development in sport. <i>Action Learning: Research and Practice</i>, 18(1), 52–66.  <a href="https://doi.org/10.1080/14767333.2020.1862050">https://doi.org/10.1080/14767333.2020.1862050</a></p>	<p>Interpretive qualitative methodology</p>	<p>Communities of practice</p>	<p>To develop the leadership capabilities and facilitation skills of social learning leaders engaged in action learning to support the CoP</p>	<p>Semi-structured interviews N=4</p>
<p>Culver, D. M., Kraft, E., &amp; Movall, N. (2019). The Iowa Communities of Practice and Innovation Pilot: Teachers' Perceptions of an Initiative to Support Blended Learning and the Integration of Technology in the Classroom. <i>Teacher Learning and Professional Development</i>, 4(1).</p>	<p>Case study</p>	<p>Communities of practice</p>	<p>To examine the value created through a CoP for teachers and analyze teachers' experiences participating in this professional development program</p>	<p>Phase 1: Personal value narrative and value creation story guided by the Value Creation Framework to assess the value created from the participants' engagement in a CoP. N=60  Phase 2: Online interviews N=17 (of the 60)  Two phases over two years.</p>

<p>Ke, F., &amp; Hoadley, C. (2009). Evaluating online learning communities. <i>Educational Technology Research and Development</i>, 57(4), 487.</p>	<p>Review article</p>	<p>Virtual CoPs are included but not the only focus.</p>	<p>Evaluates online learning communities</p>	<p>A summary of 42 evaluation papers on online learning communities. Outcome measures included: usability of system environment (that comprises protocols and tools), learning-oriented achievement, community-ness, and the integration of the three dimensions. Process measures included: usability of system environment on the levels of learning-oriented achievement and community-ness, or the correlation between participants' community-ness development and their learning-oriented achievement</p>
<p>Sims, J. M. (2018). Communities of practice: Telemedicine and online medical communities. <i>Technological Forecasting and Social Change</i>, 126, 53-63.</p>	<p>Case study</p>	<p>Communities of practice</p>	<p>To determine the effectiveness of online telemedicine services and determine if a community of practice arose</p>	<p>Questionnaires  N=? 18 people responded</p>

<p>Bond, M. A., &amp; Locke, B. B. (2018). Evaluating the effectiveness of faculty inquiry groups as communities of practice for faculty professional development. <i>Journal of Formative Design in Learning, 2</i>(1), 1-7.</p>	<p>Review of recent evaluation studies</p>	<p>Communities of practice</p>	<p>Evaluating the effectiveness of faculty inquiry groups as communities of practice for faculty professional development</p>	<p>Wenger's three structural elements, domain (area of interest and key issues), community (relationships built through activities), and practice (body of knowledge, methods, stories, and tools developed). For data sources, authors used a combination of analyzing online communications as well as interviews</p> <p>N=93 faculty members</p>
<p>McKellar, K. A., Pitzul, K. B., Juliana, Y. Y., &amp; Cole, D. C. (2014). Evaluating communities of practice and knowledge networks: a systematic scoping review of evaluation frameworks. <i>Ecohealth, 11</i>(3), 383-399.</p>	<p>Review article</p>	<p>Communities of practice</p>	<p>To understand what frameworks and methods have been proposed or used to evaluate CoPs and/or knowledge networks.</p>	<p>A summary of 19 articles that look at CoP evaluation framework components</p>

<p>Wenger, E., Trayner, B., &amp; De Laat, M. (2011). Promoting and assessing value creation in communities and networks: A conceptual framework.</p>		<p>Communities of practice</p>	<p>To provide a conceptual framework to evaluate communities of practices</p>	<p>Reviews the value creation framework and includes potential data sources/measures for each value cycle. Also discusses value-creation stories (semi-structured interviews) with potential prompts to use.</p>
<p>Bermejo-Caja, Koatz, D., Orrego, C., Perestelo-Pérez, L., González-González, A. I., Ballester, M., Pacheco-Huergo, V., Del Rey-Granado, Y., Muñoz-Balsa, M., Ramírez-Puerta, A. B., Canellas-Criado, Y., Pérez-Rivas, F. J., Toledo-Chávarri, A., &amp; Martínez-Marcos, M. (2019). Acceptability and feasibility of a virtual community of practice to primary care professionals regarding patient empowerment: a qualitative pilot study. <i>BMC Health Services Research</i>, 19(1), 403–403. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1186/s12913-019-0403-0">https://doi.org/10.1186/s12913-019-0403-0</a>.</p>	<p>Qualitative pilot study</p>	<p>Virtual community of practice</p>	<p>To assess the feasibility of a virtual community of practice</p>	<p>The authors designed a framework that lists the learning objectives of the CoP. Focus groups were held to determine if the objectives were met.</p> <p>N=12</p> <p>Two focus groups with practical nurses (6) and general practitioners (6)</p>

<p><a href="#">1186/s12913-019-4185-z</a></p>				
<p>Gottlieb, Yarris, L. M., Krzyzaniak, S. M., Natesan, S., Sherbino, J., Lin, M., &amp; Chan, T. M. (2021). Faculty development using a virtual community of practice: Three-year outcomes of the Academic Life in Emergency Medicine Faculty Incubator program. <i>AEM Education and Training</i>, 5(3), e10626–n/a. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1002/aet2.10626">https://doi.org/10.1002/aet2.10626</a></p>		<p>Virtual community of practice</p>	<p>Assess outcomes from a virtual community of practice</p>	<p>Authors applied Kirkpatrick’s program evaluation framework (reactions, learning, behaviours, outcomes) to a cross-sectional survey.</p> <p>N=89 clinicians</p> <p>Surveys at intake and at 1-year</p>

<p>Murad, Hyde, N., Chang, S., Lederman, R., Bosua, R., Pirotta, M., Audehm, R., Yates, C. J., Briggs, A. M., Gorelik, A., Chiang, C., &amp; Wark, J. D. (2019). Quantifying Use of a Health Virtual Community of Practice for General Practitioners' Continuing Professional Development: A Novel Methodology and Pilot Evaluation. <i>Journal of Medical Internet Research</i>, 21(11), e14545–e14545. <a href="https://doi.org/10.2196/14545">https://doi.org/10.2196/14545</a></p>		<p>Virtual community of practice</p>	<p>To evaluate the level of engagement of members in a virtual community of practice</p>	<p>The authors mainly relied on website analytics (number of times members logged in, time spent on website, messages exchanged) to determine level of engagement</p>
<p>Champine, R. B., Hoffman, E. E., Matlin, S. L., Strambler, M. J., &amp; Tebes, J. K. (2022). "What Does it Mean to be Trauma-Informed?": A Mixed-Methods Study of a Trauma-Informed Community Initiative. <i>Journal of Child and Family Studies</i>, 1-14.</p>	<p>Mixed-methods study</p>	<p>Communities of practice</p>	<p>To understand the experiences of education and community partners as to what it means to become trauma-informed</p>	<p>Surveys (three surveys across successive six-month periods) and focus groups</p> <p>N=82 N= 96 survey Two focus groups, N= 2 &amp; 3</p>



<p>Duarte, T., Culver, D. M., &amp; Paquette, K. (2020). Framing a social learning space for wheelchair curling. <i>International Sport Coaching Journal</i>, 1(aop), 1-13.</p>		<p>Landscapes of practice</p>	<p>How an intervention aimed at increasing the learning capability of Canadian wheelchair curling coaches</p>	<p>Individual level: N=38 interviews, N=? surveys</p> <p>Group level: N=3 social gatherings, N=4 online group meetings, N=2 focus groups</p> <p>Organizational level: online forums, N=9 online camps</p>
---	--	-------------------------------	---	---

1. <https://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.530.6663&rep=rep1&type=pdf> Online communities as communities of practice: A case study
  - This study evaluated an online community of forum. Its primary data source was the messages that were exchanged on the forum as well as interviewing the moderator of the forum. To guide the evaluation, they applied a practice-identity framework (practice refers to what the members do and identity is who the members are in regards to the practice). The authors analyzed the forum messages using this practice-identity framework to determine whether the online forum was in fact a CoP. For example, through the messages, they attempted to identify the main structural components of a CoP, such as mutual engagement (how the community interacts), a shared repertoire (what's produced from the space or the routines and language), and a joint enterprise (interest of the community).
  
2. <https://www.talent.wisc.edu/home/Portals/0/fp2e/LTD%20CoP%20Impact%20Eval%20Report%20FINAL.pdf> Communities of Practice Impact Evaluation Report
  - This CoP focus is on learning and talent development. To guide the evaluation they used Kirkpatrick's Level of Impact and Wenger's Elements of a CoP. The main data sources that were used included meeting notes, guided reflections, and surveys.
  
3. [https://journals-scholarsportal-info.proxy.library.carleton.ca/details/14767333/v18i0001/52\\_uaalatslIdis.xml](https://journals-scholarsportal-info.proxy.library.carleton.ca/details/14767333/v18i0001/52_uaalatslIdis.xml) Using an action learning approach to support women social learning leaders' development in sport (Diane Culver's article)
  - This article does not explicitly evaluate the effectiveness of a social learning space, but examines the impact of facilitators/social learning leaders of CoPs engaging in learning activities to better support the CoP. This study mainly used semi-structured interviews.
  
4. <https://journals.sfu.ca/tlpd/index.php/tlpd/article/viewFile/67/pdf> The Iowa Communities of Practice and Innovation Pilot: Teachers' Perceptions of an Initiative to Support Blended Learning and the Integration of Technology in the Classroom

- The purpose of this article was to examine the value created through a CoP for teachers and analyze teachers' experiences participating in this professional development program. The authors performed a qualitative case study that was guided by the Value Creation Framework (personal value narrative and value creation story).
5. <http://itecideas.pbworks.com/f/43520516.pdf> Evaluating online learning communities
    - This article collates and summarizes 42 evaluation papers on online learning communities. Virtual CoPs are included but not the only focus.
  6. <https://www.sciencedirect-com.proxy.library.carleton.ca/science/article/pii/S0040162516302529>  
Communities of practice: Telemedicine and online medical communities
    - In this paper, authors perform a case study to determine the effectiveness of online telemedicine services and determine if a community of practice arose. The main data source was questionnaires.
  7. [https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Mark-Bond-4/publication/322646726\\_Evaluating\\_the\\_Effectiveness\\_of\\_Faculty\\_Inquiry\\_Groups\\_as\\_Communities\\_of\\_Practice\\_for\\_Faculty\\_Professional\\_Development/links/5a90339faca2721405620f47/Evaluating-the-Effectiveness-of-Faculty-Inquiry-Groups-as-Communities-of-Practice-for-Faculty-Professional-Development.pdf](https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Mark-Bond-4/publication/322646726_Evaluating_the_Effectiveness_of_Faculty_Inquiry_Groups_as_Communities_of_Practice_for_Faculty_Professional_Development/links/5a90339faca2721405620f47/Evaluating-the-Effectiveness-of-Faculty-Inquiry-Groups-as-Communities-of-Practice-for-Faculty-Professional-Development.pdf) Evaluating the effectiveness of faculty inquiry groups as communities of practices for faculty professional development
    - This article sought to determine the effectiveness of CoPs and use Wegner's three structural elements (domain, community, and practice). For data sources, authors used a combination of analyzing online communications as well as interviews.
  8. <https://translateyar.ir/wp-content/uploads/2020/01/Evaluating-Communities.pdf> Evaluating communities of practice and knowledge networks: A systematic scoping review of evaluation frameworks

## Evaluation of a Social Learning Space Strategy

### Value Creation Framework

Value Cycle	Definition	Potential Measures and Indicators
<b>Immediate Value</b>	The experience of participating in a social learning space has value in itself What is the direct experience we want to have as we engage in a SLS?	Level of participation (tallies of attendance, number of messages shared, length of visit on website) Feedback forms or surveys that include questions about the experience of the participants
<b>Potential Value</b>	Participants can take away something that goes beyond their direct experience What potentially useful things do we want to produce?	Self-reports or surveys or interviews about takeaways, including insights and ideas
<b>Applied Value</b>	Potential value that is put into practice in a person's home environment, tools put to use in a field Where will our learning affect practice?	Stories from participants contexts reporting innovations or newly discovered solutions or approaches. Requests for implementation assistance. Feedback on reuse or repurposing material
<b>Realized Value</b>	Is the difference participants care to make Can be achievement big or small What do we hope will be our impact?	Success at solving a problem or overcoming an obstacle Saved time, effort, money, or resources
Enabling Value	People who take the initiative to hold the space (bring it into existence and nurture the quality of interactions)	Feedback forms that reflect on what works well to support learning in the space Adequate funding for participants Time and training for people who take leadership
Strategic Value	Reflects the extent and quality of conversations and relationships that help clarify the direction and usefulness of a social learning space Which stakeholders should we involve over time?	There aren't specific measures for this cycle include indicators such as: regular conversations with stakeholders, strategic documents
Orienting Value	Internal: enriching the space by understanding each other's contexts and histories and recognizing their relevance External: reach out out to build a picture of the broader landscape, find relevant resources, and develop relationships to other spaces What other locations in the broader landscape do we have to include in our orientation?	Appreciating the diversity of backgrounds and contexts among participants, good understanding of the location of the social learning space in the broader landscape
Transformative Value	Having broader transformative effects beyond the specific difference participants care to make Something in the space that causes a transformation outside the space	Changes in identity beyond the space, changes in policies or regulations

	What trends or possible changes should we get ready for?	
--	--	--